## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welcome and Introductions</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee Deliverables</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Update: State Action Plan</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Update: Legislative Developments</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next Steps and Wrap-Up</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© California Telehealth Policy Coalition
Deliverables for the Broadband Committee for 2020

- Establish repository of information on broadband policy at federal and state levels: key initiatives, funding priorities, speed standards (see appendix)

- Review of broadband policy items: legislation, regulation, other items (Ongoing) (see Coalition comments on draft State Broadband Action Plan)

- Develop an informational fact sheet on broadband basics (push out/reconsider once policy items are developed)
  - Consider: Lifeline Program in California; update on State Action Plan; legislative developments

- Submit letters of support for state legislation
Finalized State Broadband Council Action Plan

- **Availability: Speed and Reliability**
  - High performance Broadband needs have increased
  - Residential availability today
  - Insufficient network resilience and redundancy
  - The market underserves poor, rural, black and brown communities and Tribal Areas
  - Multi-billion dollars required to build out statewide fiber

- **Affordability**
  - Broadband prices are high largely because there is very little fixed broadband competition.
  - We must adopt new models that don’t rely exclusively on provider-owned infrastructure and employ a service-based competition model where multiple internet services are available over the same cable or wire entering your home.

- **Devices and Digital Literacy**
  - Digital literacy is core to access and adoption

- **Data**
  - Data about the costs, gaps, speeds and access to broadband in California is insufficient:
  - We need broadband data that has better granularity, accuracy and less opacity: subscription data by address
California Broadband Council Action Plan: Finalized

Action Items:

- Modernize broadband speed and performance standards
- Simplify processes and leverage existing assets and construction
- Set reliability standards
- Increase access to affordable broadband services and devices
- Promote affordable broadband services and devices
- Encourage broadband competition
- Strengthen partnerships and coordinate initiatives
- Improve broadband data and mapping transparency and usability
- Develop technical assistance and support
- Bolster partnerships

The final State Action Plan can be found on the Broadband Council website
AB 14/SB 4 Analysis, Discussion of Support

Broadband Committee Members: Larry Ozeran and Fabiola Carrión
Legislative Staff: George Soares, Sen. Lena Gonzalez’s Office; Samantha Samuelsen, Asm. Aguiar-Curry’s Office

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principle</th>
<th>Determination</th>
<th>Reasoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broadband should be treated as a utility.</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Keeps statutory language allowing CPUC to regulate telecommunications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robust infrastructure should be in place to serve all Californians.</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Includes language requiring CPUC to prioritize CASF infrastructure projects to unserved areas (speeds below 25mbps/3mbps)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Californians should have equitable access to broadband.</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Includes language requiring CPUC to prioritize CASF infrastructure projects to unserved areas (speeds below 25mbps/3mbps); requires certain sub-priorities including focus on high-poverty areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadband should be affordable.</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Authorizes the use of funds in the Rural and Urban Regional Broadband Consortia Grant Account to provide free, low-cost, income-qualified or affordable home internet service offers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government should fund broadband projects that rely on best-in-class, high-speed standards.</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>Includes stated goal of 100mbps downstream which would support fiber optic for first-mile projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommendations and Next Steps for the Legislation Committee

- Approved by Legislation Committee and full Coalition for support
Governor’s proposed budget includes funding for broadband

- **Broadband**: “California will meet these challenges with a coordinated state effort based on key actions over the next five years to provide every Californian a reliable and affordable connection… The [State Action] Plan, adopted in December, lays out three main goals: that all Californians have access to high-performance broadband at home, that all Californians can afford broadband and the devices necessary to access the Internet, and that all Californians can access training and support to enable digital inclusion…”
  - **Lifeline Program**: est. $399M in expenditures in 2021-22 (inc. from $411M in 2020-21)
  - **California Advanced Services Fund**: est. $81.3M in expenditures (same as 2020-21)
# Federal Legislative Developments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bill</th>
<th>Recent Developments</th>
<th>Brief Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Consolidated Appropriations Act, 2021</strong></td>
<td>Signed into Law (12/27/20)</td>
<td>• Adds permanently rural emergency hospitals to list of originating sites eligible for telehealth reimbursement in Medicare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Exempts permanently the diagnosis, evaluation or treatment of mental health disorder from Medicare rural geographic reimbursement, allows for the home as the originating site (provider must have provided an in-person within six months prior to the telehealth visit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Adds on a temporary basis during COVID-19 virtual home visits conducted solely by the use of electronic information and telecommunications technology for the Maternal, Infant and Early Childhood Home Visit Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Allocates $ to the FCC COVID-19 Telehealth Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Allocates $ to broadband programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Authorizes $60M to remain available until expended for grants for telemedicine and distance learning services in rural areas under the Distance Learning, Telemedicine and Broadband Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Requires that group health plans and health insurers not impose cost-sharing requirements on telehealth services furnished by participating health care facilities (in-network) any higher than in-person services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© California Telehealth Policy Coalition
Next Steps

• Write and submit letters of support for state legislation

• Next Broadband Committee Meeting (2/16 from 1-2pm)
Appendix
Other Organizations and Resources

Advocacy and Research Organizations

• Electronic Frontier Foundation
• National Digital Inclusion Alliance
• Media Justice
• Greenlining Institute
• Benton Institute for Broadband and Society
• Open Technology Institute (New America)
• ITU Broadband Commission for sustainable development
• The PEW Charitable Trust

Government Organizations

• Federal Communications Commission
• California Public Utilities Commission
• California Broadband Council
• Office of the National Coordinator for Health Information Technology
• California Broadband and Digital Literacy Office
Finalized Coalition Broadband Principles

- **Broadband should be treated as a utility**: policies should treat broadband as a utility necessary for Californians to access health care and other services and needs in the 21st century.

- **Robust infrastructure should be in place to serve all Californians**: policies expand the physical infrastructure needed to bring internet access to underserved populations and geographies.

- **Californians should have equitable access to broadband**: policies ensure increased access to broadband for underserved communities, both urban and rural.

- **Broadband should be affordable**: policies should support making high-quality internet access affordable for all Californians, including the use of subsidies and/or price setting.

- **Government should fund broadband projects that rely on best-in-class, high-speed standards**: policies ensure that infrastructure, accessibility and affordability reinforce the need for high-speed, best in class technologies.
Purpose of the Broadband Subgroup

The Telehealth Policy Coalition Broadband Subgroup brings together Coalition members to work collaboratively to advance broadband policy in California by

- **Provide guiding principles** for the Coalition in developing its policy priorities; scoring legislation, regulation and other policies; and developing educational materials and events

- **Monitor emerging policy issues** related to broadband including funding opportunities, legislation, and community-specific internet needs

- **Solve problems and share resources** with other participants in an effective and efficient manner during weekly meetings

- **Serve as an expert source of information** to elevate the Coalition as a state thought leader on broadband issues
## Coalition Comments on State Broadband Action Plan

Please find our letter attached with today’s materials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coalition Comments (submitted November 20)</th>
<th>Corresponding Action Plan Updates (Latest Draft November 18)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Include detail on broadband access and usage in the health care context in descriptions of the current state of broadband</strong></td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES</strong> include more information on broadband usage in health care context in current state of broadband</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➢ We specifically request that the Council note that there is a dearth of data on health and broadband</td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES NOT</strong> call out dearth of data on health and broadband</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Expand the list of principles to account for more issues such as infrastructure, access and equity</strong></td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES</strong> call for broadband to be treated as a necessity, robust infrastructure to serve all Californians, equitable access, affordability, funding prioritization for projects that will deliver at least 100 Mbps down/10 Mbps up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➢ Requested that they incorporate our Coalition broadband principles</td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES NOT</strong> include all of these principles in their core “vision”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Include work activities that specifically address health care providers and patient involvement in broadband delivery, adoption, reliability and digital literacy</strong></td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES</strong> call for improved broadband data collection and technical assistance and support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➢ Requested support for and data collection on health care providers and patients</td>
<td>➢ <strong>DOES NOT</strong> call out health care providers or patients specifically</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© California Telehealth Policy Coalition
AB 14 Communications: broadband services: California Advanced Services Fund (Aguiar-Curry et al.) (1/3)

- Authorizes local educational agencies (LEA) to report to CDE student needs for computing devices and internet connectivity; requires CDE and CPUC to compile this information and post it on the CDE website
- Authorizes county boards of supervisors to “acquire, construct, improve, maintain or operate” broadband internet access service; if BOS do so, requires them to take certain actions regarding the accessing of content by end users
- Requires GO-Biz to develop recommendations and a model for streamlined land use approval and construction permitting for broadband infrastructure projects
- Requires CPUC to prioritize projects in “unserved areas” (90% of area has no broadband provider offers at least 25mbps/3mbps service) for CASF infrastructure funding, with a goal of achieving 100 mbps downstream
  - First prioritize areas with only 10mbps/1mbps
  - Once 98% of a region reaches goal of 100 mbps, CPUC must prioritize only middle-mile infrastructure
  - Requires CPUC to maximize investments in new and scalable infrastructure
  - Authorizes CPUC to leverage CASF funds to be used for federal match
Legislative Developments

AB 14 Communications: broadband services: California Advanced Services Fund (Aguiar-Curry et al.) (2/3)

- Deletes CPUC authorization to collect up to $330M in surcharges
  - Authorizes CPUC to collect the surcharge in amount not exceed an unspecified percentage of an end user’s service costs within CA
  - Authorizes Rural and Urban Regional Broadband Consortia Grant Account for additional uses including to promote the adoption of free, low-cost, income-qualified or affordable home internet service offers
- Requires the CASF program to promote learning and telehealth
- Removes requirement for certain money transfers from the Broadband Public Housing Account not awarded by 12/31/20 back to the Broadband Infrastructure Grant Account; makes these moneys available for grants and loans for network deployment in eligible publicly support communities
- Repeals certain provisions affecting facility-based broadband providers (including certain requirements that these providers demonstrate that they can deploy broadband to existing facilities within 180 days
- Authorizes CPUC to issue bonds in amount up to $1B, establishes an account within the CASF for deposit
• Requires CPUC to annually conduct a financial audit and performance audit of CASF for the legislature, beginning on or before 4/1/2023

• Requires CPUC to provide status report on broadband service in unserved areas and CASF balance, annually into perpetuity

• Authorizes CPUC to require ISPs to report specified information regarding each “free, low-cost, income-qualified or affordable” plan advertised by the provider

• Repeals current methodology for VoIP surcharges

• Clarifies that AB 14 is an urgency bill
Key differences from AB 14:

- Does **not** include further considerations for prioritizing projects in unserved areas that are included in AB 14:
  - Projects that connect households in an area where internet connectivity is available only through dial-up service, that is not served by any form of wireline or wireless facility-based broadband service, and that is a high-poverty area.
  - Projects that connect households in areas an area where internet connectivity is available only through dial-up service that are and that is not served by any form of wireline or wireless facility-based broadband service or areas with no internet connectivity.
  - Projects that connect households in an unserved area that is a high-poverty area.
  - Projects that connect households in an unserved area.

- Only requires GO-Biz to coordinate with other state, local and national orgs. to explore ways to facilitate land use approvals; not report required

- Includes a surcharge rate: not to exceed $0.23 per month per access line

- Does not explicitly require CPUC to promote telehealth
Key differences from AB 14:

• Does not authorize CPUC to require ISPs to report specified information regarding each “free, low-cost, income-qualified or affordable” plan advertised by the provider

• Does not repeal current methodology for VoIP surcharges
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principle</th>
<th>Determination</th>
<th>Reasoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broadband should be treated as a utility.</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>Keeps statutory language allowing CPUC to regulate telecommunications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robust infrastructure should be in place to serve all Californians.</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>Includes language requiring CPUC to prioritize CASF infrastructure projects to unserved areas (speeds below 25mbps/3mbps)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Californians should have equitable access to broadband.</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>Includes language requiring CPUC to prioritize CASF infrastructure projects to unserved areas (speeds below 25mbps/3mbps); requires certain sub-priorities including focus on high-poverty areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadband should be affordable.</td>
<td>✅</td>
<td>Authorizes the use of funds in the Rural and Urban Regional Broadband Consortia Grant Account to provide free, low-cost, income-qualified or affordable home internet service offers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government should fund broadband projects that rely on best-in-class, high-speed standards.</td>
<td>❌</td>
<td>Includes stated goal of 100mbps downstream significantly lower than fiber standards of 250mbps+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recommendations and Next Steps for the Legislation Committee

- Understand bill authors’ intent to reconcile the two bills
- Understand whether SB 4 will adopt telehealth promotion language
Other Recent Developments

• Little Hoover Commission releases issue brief on California’s Digital Divide
  • California rated 13th in the nation on broadband, based on coverage, speed and pricing
  • Some regions have had successful efforts to promote broadband (e.g., Santa Monica and South Bay Cities Council of Governments efforts to bring fiber to government and residential users)
Opportunity to shape broadband policy this year

Executive Order N-73-20 requires the California Broadband Council to create a new statewide broadband plan by 12/31/20; directs minimum speed of 100 Mbps download speed for state infrastructure/ investments

California Broadband Council: California State Broadband Action Plan

- Seeking public comment by noon, Friday, November 20, 2020 on what should be in the new state plan
- Hosting listening sessions and action plan working sessions

Listening Sessions

Broadband Communities Focus hosted by California Forward

September 29 9:30 am – 11:00 am, Video Recording 9-29-20
October 29 9:30 am – 11:00 am via Go To Webinar

Local Governments Focus hosted by the California Transportation Agency

October 1 10:00 am – 11:00 am, Video Recording 10-1-20
October 29 1:00 pm – 2:00 pm via ZOOM (Registration is required upon logging in.)

Internet Service Providers Focus hosted by the California Department of Technology

October 7 2:30 pm – 4:00 pm, Video Recording 10-7-20
October 29 3:00 pm – 4:00 pm via ZOOM (Registration is required upon logging in.)

Action Plan Working Sessions

October 27 Action Plan Working Session, Agenda 10-27, Virtual Meeting 10-27
November 3 Action Plan Working Session, Agenda 11-3, Virtual Meeting 11-3
November 4 Action Plan Working Session, Agenda 11-4, Virtual Meeting 11-4

© California Telehealth Policy Coalition
Subgroup Administration

• **Meeting Cadence:** Monthly through the end of 2020

• **Membership:** Open to all Coalition members

• **Staff Contacts:**
  - Mei Kwong: meik@cchpca.org
  - Robby Franceschini: robb.franceschini@bluepathhealth.com
  - Aria Javidan: ariaj@cchpca.org
Recap from last meeting

- Reviewed the purpose and administration of the subgroup
- Discussed key deliverables (see next slide)
- Shared knowledge on broadband basics (see appendix)
- Discussed draft principles (for additional discussion today)
Definitions

- **Broadband**: refers to the speed of data transmission; defined by the FCC in 2015 as 25 Mbps download, 3 Mbps upload, defined by the California Legislature in 2017 as 6 Mbps/1 Mbps

- **Cable internet**: use of coaxial lines to deliver internet access (Broadband Now, 2020)

- **California Advanced Services Fund (CASF)**: fund overseen by CPUC that provides grants to “telephone corporations” to bridge the “digital divide” in unserved and underserved areas

- **California Broadband Council**: 12-member council run by the California Department of Technology; helps set state strategy on broadband policy

- **California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC)**: state administrative agency that regulates services and utilities, protects consumers, safeguards the environment, and assures Californians’ access to safe and reliable infrastructure and services (CPUC, 2020)

- **Digital Divide**: refers to discrepancies in access to broadband between populations and geographies (CASF Annual Report, 2019)

- **Digital Subscriber Line (DSL) internet**: use of cooper telephone line to deliver internet (Broadband Now, 2020)

- **Federal Communications Commission (FCC)**: federal administrative agency that administers federal broadband funding programs, sets federal broadband standards, oversees the federal Lifeline Program

- **Fiber internet**: use of fiber optic cables to deliver internet (Broadband Now, 2020)

- **Internet**: an electronic communications network that connects computer networks and organizational computer facilities, consisting of interconnected networks using standardized communication protocols (Oxford English Dictionary)
Knowledge Sharing: Internet Options

- **DSL**: uses copper telephone line to deliver internet
- **Cable**: uses coaxial lines to deliver internet
- **Fiber Optic**: uses fiber optic cables to deliver internet

Emergence of fiber optic has changed what we think of as “fast” internet

### Increase in speed potential

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Adopted</th>
<th>Minimum Download</th>
<th>Minimum Upload</th>
<th>FCC Commissioner</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>25 Mbps</td>
<td>3 Mbps</td>
<td>Tom Wheeler, D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>4 Mbps</td>
<td>1 Mbps</td>
<td>Julius Genachowski, D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>200 Kbps</td>
<td>200 Kbps</td>
<td>William Kennard, D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>Download speed range</th>
<th>Upload speed range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DSL</td>
<td>5-35 Mbps</td>
<td>1-10 Mbps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cable</td>
<td>10-500 Mbps</td>
<td>5-50 Mbps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiber</td>
<td>250-1,000 Mbps</td>
<td>250-1,000 Mbps</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FCC definition has increased over past three decades

California speeds are lower than the FCC in defining who is “unserved”

- 2008: 3 mbps/ 1 mbps (2007 CPUC authorization)
- 2012: 6 mbps/ 1.5 mbps (2012 CPUC rulemaking)
- 2017: 6 mbps/ 1 mbps (2017 legislation)

Knowledge Sharing: Who Oversees Broadband, Various Initiatives

California

- **California Broadband Council**: 12-member council run by the California Department of Technology; helps set state strategy on broadband policy
  - Next meeting: Sept. 23: action plan discussion
- **California Advanced Services Fund**: provide grants to "telephone corporations" to bridge the "digital divide" in unserved and underserved areas;
  - Overseen by CPUC
  - May collect up to $66M annually in surcharges from consumer telecoms bills
  - Funds “last mile” projects

State initiatives

- **Newsom E.O.** (Aug. 2020): Broadband Council directed to develop new State Broadband Action Plan by December 31, 2020; goal of 100 mbps download for all households
- **California Telehealth Network**: helps health care systems connect to high-speed broadband networks; assists with bidding process, subsidy funding, network monitoring

Federal Government

- **Federal Communications Commission**
  - Speed standard: 25 mbps download/ 3 mbps upload
  - Mapping Broadband Health in America- geomapping platform to understand gaps in connectivity
  - Rural Digital Opportunity Fund (proposed 2019)- up to $20.4M in subsidies for businesses/households
  - Connect America Funds (last auction 2018): funds for provider infrastructure; $1.49B dispersed over 10 years
  - Digital Opportunity Data Collection- for better mapping
- **U.S. Dept. of Agriculture**
  - Rural Development Broadband ReConnect Program – loans for construction, improvement, acquisition costs for infrastructure; over $826M invested to date
Limited access for certain populations:

- Several populations have limited broadband at home: rural (59%), African American (67%), Latino (66%), low-income (55%) (survey based on 25mbps/2mbps standard)\(^1\)
- Californians making <$20K per year are unconnected (30%) or smartphone only access (18%)\(^2\)

Overview of Lifeline Program (1/2)

- Started by federal gov’t in 1985 to increase access to home phone service for low-income Americans. Has since expanded to cover mobile phone service and mobile/fixed broadband

Federal Lifeline Program:
- Up to $9.25/month discount on mobile or fixed phone or broadband service
- Administered by FCC, distrib. By USAC (except in CA, OR, TX)
- Minimum service req’ts:
  - Mobile voice: 1000 minutes
  - Mobile broadband: at least 3GB with a speed of 3G or higher (increasing this December to 11.75GB)
  - Fixed broadband: at least 1024 GB with speed of 20/3 Mbps
- Eligibility: 135% FPL; participation in federal assistance programs; through child or dependent
- Utilization: varies widely by state
- Funding: comes from Universal Service Fund (USF), based on current surcharge levied on cell phone bills (27.1%)

California Lifeline Program:
- Up to $14.95/month discount on phone
  - $24.10 when combined with federal
- Administered/distrib. by CPUC
- Does not cover broadband: only fixed voice service or mobile service with mobile broadband
- Same minimum mobile service requirements as federal ones
- Example vendors: SafeLink Wireless and Truconnect
- Some health plans promote with members: California Health & Wellness
  - Plans can add minutes, telehealth apps pre-downloaded
- Eligibility: 150% FPL; participation in federal assistance program; through child or dependent
- Utilization: 43.5% (2019)
- Funding: USF surcharge, plus state surcharge (6.94%)
Overview of Lifeline Program (2/2)

Problems with Lifeline Program:

- Complex application and renewal process: requires mailing address, phone/internet access to apply; 25% renewal success rate
- Lack of awareness: no formal state and/or federal marketing
- Limitation of eligibility: only one discount per household
- Limited service plans: must be approved by FCC/CPUC
- Gaps in connectivity: bundled plans only have around 3GB per month of data
Broadband Resources and References


Lifeline Program- Resources and References

- “California LifeLine Administrator Presentation to the Administrative Committee” [https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUC_Public_Website/Content/Utilities_and_Industries/Communications_-_Telecommunications_and_Broadband/Consumer_Programs/California_LifeLine_Program/Conduent-Overview_AC_Meeting_March%202019.pdf](https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUC_Public_Website/Content/Utilities_and_Industries/Communications_-_Telecommunications_and_Broadband/Consumer_Programs/California_LifeLine_Program/Conduent-Overview_AC_Meeting_March%202019.pdf).
- “California Lifeline Program.” [https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/lifeline/](https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/lifeline/).